Appendix C: Sample Consultation Letters and Consultation Responses

C.1 Sample Agency/NHO Consultation Letter

CULTURAL SURVEYS HAWAI'I

ARCHAEOLOGICAL, CULTURAL, AND HISTORICAL DOCUMENTATION SERVICES - SINCE 1982

O'ahu Island
P.O. Box 1114
Kailua, Hawai'i 96734
Ph: (808) 262-9972
Fax: (808) 262-4950

Maui Island
1993 Main Street
Wailuku, Hawai'i 96793
Ph: (808) 242-9882
Fax: (808) 244-1994

Branch Offices:
Hilo, Hawai'i
Kona, Hawai'i
Lāwai, Kaua'i

June 3, 2011

O‘ahu Island Burial Council
ATTN: Chairperson Kawika McKeague
State Historic Preservation Division
601 Kamokila Blvd., Suite 555
Kapolei, HI 96707

Subject: Cultural Survey Hawai‘i’s cultural consultation request regarding the preparation of an Archaeological Inventory Survey Plan (AISP) for the proposed Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project (HHCTCP) Construction Phase 3 (Airport), Hālawa and Moanalua Ahupua‘a, ‘Ewa and Honolulu Districts, O‘ahu Island.

CSH Job Code: HALAWA 6

Dear Mr. McKeague:

On behalf of PB Americas, Inc. (PB), and for the City & County of Honolulu (City) and the Federal Transit Administration (FTA), Cultural Surveys Hawai‘i, Inc. (CSH) is preparing an Archaeological Inventory Survey Plan (AISP) for the HHCTCP Construction Phase 3 (Airport). This federal undertaking, utilizing FTA funding, will encompass the area between Kalaloa Drive (just northwest of Hālawa Stream) in the west to Middle Street (just west of Kalihi Stream) in the east.

The HHCTCP project is intended to provide high-capacity rapid transit in the highly congested east-west transportation corridor between Kapolei and the Ala Moana Center via a fixed guideway rail transit system. In addition to the guideway, the project will require construction of transit stations and ancillary support facilities, including within Phase 3 the proposed Pearl Harbor Naval Base Station, the Honolulu International Airport Station, and the Lagoon Drive Station. Project construction will also require relocation of existing utility lines within the project corridor that conflict with the proposed project design. Minimally, land disturbing activities would include grading of facility locations and excavations for guideway column foundations, subsurface utility relocation and installation, and station and ancillary facility foundation construction. For detailed project route descriptions and photographic figures, please see the documents included with this letter.

Due to federal (FTA) funding, this project requires compliance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act and Hawai‘i State Historic Preservation legislation (Hawai‘i Revised Statutes Chapter 6E and Hawai‘i Administration Rules Chapter 13-275). Consequent to the Section 106 historic preservation review process, a Programmatic Agreement (PA) was executed on January 18, 2011, requiring an

WWW.CULTURALSURVEYS.COM - INFO@CULTURALSURVEYS.COM

OIBC **Page 2**

June 3, 2011

Archaeological Inventory Survey Plan (AISP) be prepared and approved by the State Historic Preservation Division (SHPD) for each HHCTCP construction phase (PA Stipulation III.A). In accordance with this PA and with Hawai'i Administration Rules (HAR) Chapter 13-275-5(c)(3), regarding consultation with individuals and interested parties knowledgeable about the project area, CSH is seeking cultural resource information (*mana'o*) regarding the land use history of the project area and its cultural context.

CSH would be appreciative of any knowledge you might have of the project area, specifically regarding the general history and land use of the project area, knowledge of archaeological sites and burials, legends and *mo'olelo* associated with the area, and knowledge of the natural landscape and how it changed over the course of historic times. Additionally, any referrals of *kūpuna* or elders and *kama'aina* who might be willing to share their cultural knowledge of the project area and the surrounding *ahupua'a* lands would be of great assistance.

Thank you very much for your assistance with this consultation process. Your response is requested within 30 days of receipt of this letter in order to ensure the inclusion of relevant cultural information within the HHCTCP Phase 3 Archaeological Inventory Survey Plan and historic preservation review process. Your response will become part of the project's historic preservation administration record and will assist the project's compliance with both Hawai'i state and federal historic preservation legislation. Your response will also help ensure that the proposed project's cultural resource management review and mitigation decisions are based on the most accurate cultural information. Please contact me with any questions.

Sincerely,

Matt McDermott
Projects Manager
Cultural Surveys Hawai'i, Inc.
Email: mmcdermott@cultural surveys.com
Office: (808) 262-9972
Cell: (808) 754-8852

Project Area Route for HHCTCP Construction Phase 3 (Airport)

The area of potential effect (APE) for the HHCTCP Construction Phase 3 extends from Kamehameha Highway at Kalaloa Drive in the west to the intersection of Kamehameha Highway and Middle Street in the east. Beginning at the western end of the project area (where it meets the southeast end of the HHCTCP Construction Phase 2 AIS project corridor), the route follows Kamehameha Highway to Radford Drive. The Pearl Harbor Naval Base Station platform will extend over Kamehameha Highway with an associated transit station entrance building on the ground level on the southeast corner of Radford Drive and Kamehameha Highway. From the Pearl Harbor Naval Base Station the route continues south on Kamehameha Highway passing over the Center Drive intersection where it continues south on the *makai* (west) side of Makai Frontage road (on the *makai* side of Kamehameha Highway) crossing to the *makai* side of Nimitz Highway. by Valkenburgh Street. The route continues southeast on the *makai* side of Nimitz and the H-1 Freeway viaduct passing Main Street and Elliott Street. Just east of Elliott Street the route arcs *mauka* over the east bound lanes of the H-1 Freeway and then curves *makai* again crossing the east bound lanes of the H-1. The route continues south (*makai*) roughly parallel to the east side of the *mauka/makai* trending southwest end of Aolele Street curving east at Ala Onaona Street to the Honolulu International Airport Station. The Honolulu International Airport Station will be constructed in an at-grade parking area, just northwest of the main Honolulu Airport overseas parking structure. From that station the route continues east on the *makai* side of Ala Onaona Street. East of Pai‘ea Street the route veers slightly *mauka* crossing *mauka* of Aolele Street to Ualena Street. The route then follows Ualena Street crossing Lagoon Drive. The Lagoon Drive Station will be immediately east of Lagoon Drive on the south portion of Waiwai Loop (*mauka* and *makai* entrance buildings will be on either side of this portion of Waiwai Loop). From that station the route continues east on the south side of the south portion of Waiwai Loop crossing over an area of warehouses to Ke‘ehi Lagoon Beach Park. The route angles northeast through Ke‘ehi Lagoon Beach Park, *makai* of the tennis courts, and crosses Maunalua Stream *makai* and parallel to Nimitz Highway. In the short stretch between Moanalua Stream and Kalihi Stream the route crosses *mauka* of of Nimitz Highway joining Kamehameha Highway at the Middle Street intersection (where it meets the HHCTCP Construction Phase 4 AIS project area).

C.2 Sample Individual Consultation Letter

Ena Sroat

From: Ena Sroat [esroat@culturalsurveys.com]
Sent: Monday, June 13, 2011 10:37 AM
To: 'hawaiianhistory@gmail.com'
Subject: Cultural consultation request regarding the preparation of an archaeological inventory survey plan (AISP) for the HHCTCP Construction Phase 3 (Airport) (Halawa & Moanalua Ahupua'a)

Aloha Ms. Gora:

Under the terms of the Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project's (HHCTCP) Programmatic Agreement (PA), Cultural Surveys Hawai'i (CSH) is preparing an archaeological inventory survey plan (AISP) for the Airport construction section (Kalaloa Drive to Middle Street). In accordance with this PA and with Hawaii Administration Rules (HAR) Chapter 13-275-5(c)(3), CSH is seeking cultural resource information regarding the land use of the project area and its cultural context. During the recent June 8th, 2011 OIBC meeting at the Kalanimoku Building you described your genealogical and cultural connection to Halawa Ahupua'a, through which the HHCTCP Phase 3 will traverse. CSH would appreciate any *mana'o* and knowledge of the *ahupua'a* of Halawa that you would be willing to share, such as traditional place names, *mo'olelo*, land use, cultural practices, old photographs, where families lived, etc. This information will assist in documenting the land use and cultural context of the *ahupua'a* , as well as help to identify areas of cultural resources and sensitivity. CSH would welcome any *mana'o* or *ninau* you might have. I can be contacted at any time via telephone or email.

Ena Sroat
Archaeological Technician
Cultural Surveys Hawaii, Inc.
Office (808) 262-9972
Cell (808) 428-1156
esroat@culturalsurveys.com

1

C.3 OHA Consultation Response Letter

PHONE (808) 594-1888

FAX (808) 594-1865

STATE OF HAWAI'I
OFFICE OF HAWAIIAN AFFAIRS
711 KAPI'OLANI BOULEVARD, SUITE 500
HONOLULU, HAWAI'I 96813

HRD11/2156V

June 30, 2011

Matt McDermott, Projects Manager
Cultural Surveys Hawai'i, Inc.
P.O. Box 1114
Kailua, Hawai'i 96734

Re: Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project
"Phase 3"- Archaeological Inventory Survey Plan
Island of O'ahu

Aloha e Matt McDermott,

The Office of Hawaiian Affairs is in receipt of your June 1, 2011 letter seeking comments ahead of the submittal of a draft archaeological inventory survey plan for "Phase 3" of the Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project to the State Historic Preservation Division.

Pursuant to Stipulation III(A)(2) of the Programmatic Agreement (PA) for the Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project (undertaking), an archaeological inventory survey plan (AISP) for each of the four construction phases of the undertaking must be submitted to the State of Hawai'i Department of Land and Natural Resources-State Historic Preservation Division (SHPD). The SHPD will then have thirty (30) days to accept the AISP or provide comments that will be considered and possibly incorporated into a revised AISP.

The Federal Transit Administration (FTA) has delegated the responsibilities of implementing the stipulations of the PA to the City and County of Honolulu, who in turn, has contracted with Cultural Surveys Hawai'i, Inc. to develop AISP for each of the four construction phases. It is our understanding CSH has or will be conducting the fieldwork described in each of the four AISP. By letter dated May 5, 2011, OHA provided our comments on the "Phase 4" AISP to the FTA. You were copied on this letter.

Thank you for your prompt email response to our June 29, 2011 telephone inquiry requesting additional information on the amount and locations of test excavations which will be proposed in the draft AISP. "Phase 3" of this undertaking extends from Kalaloa Drive (just northwest of Halawa Stream) in the west to Middle Street (just west of Kalihi Stream) in the east and includes the Pearl Harbor Naval Base, Honolulu Airport and Lagoon Drive stations. The historic maps (dated 1817 and 1890), overview of Land

Commission Awards (LCA) and proposed locations and amount of test excavations described in the attachments to your email were very helpful in our review. A total of 40 test excavations are currently proposed in this phase of the undertaking, an amount which is comparable the amount in the approved AISP for "Phase 2" of the undertaking.

Based on your background research, a limited information on land use is described in historic maps and a total of five LCA are identified adjacent to the "Phase 3" alignment, which follows the existing roads through a heavily developed corridor. OHA recognizes that existing development and infrastructure within the "footprint" of this phase of the undertaking directly impacts the extent, locations and schedule of archaeological excavations (excavations). To the extent feasible, OHA advocates that excavations be conducted in areas which will be subject to ground disturbing activities once actual construction begins to ensure any subsurface cultural resources or iwi kupuna are identified and afforded appropriate mitigation.

OHA has no additional comments or referrals to other individuals and organizations for consultation to offer at this time. We look forward to reviewing the results of the archaeological inventory survey for this phase of the undertaking. Thank you for your continued efforts to implement the requirements of the PA and the opportunity to comment on the "Phase 3" AISP. Should you have any questions, please contact Keola Lindsey at 594-0244 or keolal@oha.org.

'O wau iho nō me ka 'oia'i'o,

Clyde W. Nāmu'o
Chief Executive Officer

C: OHA-Board of Trustees
William J. Aila, Jr.- State Historic Preservation Officer
Louis Brodnitz, Advisory Council on Historic Preservation
Faith Miyamoto, City and County of Honolulu
Ted Matley, Federal Transit Authority
Leslie T. Rogers, Federal Transit Authority, Region IX Regional Administrator
Pua Aiu, Administrator, State Historic Preservation Division
Consulting Parties

C.4 SHPD Consultation Response Letter

NEIL ABERCROMBIE
GOVERNOR OF HAWAII

WILLIAM J. AILA, JR.
CHAIRPERSON
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

GUY H. KAULUKUKUI
FIRST DEPUTY

WILLIAM M. TAM
DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT
ENGINEERING
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION
LAND
STATE PARKS

STATE OF HAWAII
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION DIVISION
601 KAMOKILA BLVD., RM. 555
KAPOLEI, HI 96707

August 11, 2011

Matt McDermott, Projects Manager
Cultural Surveys Hawaii
P.O. Box 1114
Kailua, Hawaii 96734

LOG NO. 2011.1611
DOC NO 1108PC006

Dear Matt McDermott:

Subject: HALAWA 6: Cultural Surveys Hawaii's cultural consultation request regarding the preparation of an Archaeological Inventory Survey Plan (AISP) for the proposed Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project (HHCTCP) Construction Phase 3 (Airport), Halawa and Moanalua Ahupua'a, 'Ewa and Honolulu Districts, O'ahu Island.

Mahalo for the opportunity to consult on the aforementioned proposed project regarding the HHCTCP and its impact on the historic and cultural resources in the project area. Please accept my apologies for missing your deadline of July 1, 2011 and hope some of our mana'o will be helpful to your work.

Consultation is important with folks who are familiar with the environs in this project area. The SHPD offers the following strategies for a diverse outreach in the community. Please contact the following for leads and/or referrals to gather more historic and cultural information:

1. The O'ahu Island Burial Council members. Please call SHPD for their contact list.
2. The Moanalua Valley Foundation located in the historic Moanalua Gardens and who are the steward of the valley and its significant sites, burials, etc.
3. The Oral History project at the University of Hawaii Manoa who have been interviewing folks for decades and have documented years of Hawaiian history.
4. The Hawaii Historic library on the grounds of the Hawaiian Mission Homes.
5. Seeking referrals at the Neighborhood Board meetings of those respective communities.
6. Seeking referrals or talk story with Kupuna at Senior Citizen groups in those communities.
7. An exhaustive literature research at the Bishop Museum and the State Archives.
8. Talk story with the professional staff at the UH-Manoa Center for Hawaiian Studies.

The SHPD looks forward to your report on the traditional cultural history of the project area.

Please call me directly at 808-692-8025 or via email at Phyllis.L.Cayan@hawaii.gov should you have any questions on the above strategies. Also, my apologies for the lateness of this reply.

Sincerely,

Phyllis Coochie Cayan

Phyllis Coochie Cayan
History & Culture Branch Chief