
Section 7 Significance

The inventory survey investigation and documentation of the study area's archaeological cultural resources have provided sufficient information for significance evaluations (see Cultural Resource Descriptions Section and the following discussion). Cultural resource significance is evaluated and expressed as eligibility for listing on the National and/or Hawai'i Register. To be considered eligible for listing on the National and/or Hawai'i Register a cultural resource should possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and/or association, and meet one or more of the following broad cultural/historic significance criteria (36 CFR 60.4 and HAR §13-275-6):

- A. Reflects major trends or events in the history of the state or nation
- B. Associated with the lives of persons significant in our past
- C. Excellent example of a site type/work of a master
- D. Has yielded or may be likely to yield information important in prehistory or history
- E. (Hawai'i Register only) has cultural significance to an ethnic group, including, but not limited to, religious structures, burials, and traditional cultural properties

As discussed in Section 1.2, cultural resources are the physical remains and/or geographic locations that reflect the activity, heritage, and/or beliefs of ethnic groups, local communities, states, and/or nations. Generally, they are at least 50 years old (although there are exceptions) and include: buildings and structures; groupings of buildings or structures (historic districts); certain objects; archaeological artifacts, features, sites, and/or deposits; groupings of archaeological sites (archaeological districts); and, in some instances, natural landscape features and/or geographic locations of cultural significance. The current investigation was tasked with the identification of only archaeological cultural resources.

In federal historic preservation legislation, significance determinations (expressed as eligibility to the National Register) are generally made by a federal agency official in consultation with the SHPO. Under Hawai'i State historic preservation legislation, significance determinations (expressed as eligibility to the Hawai'i Register) result when a state agency official's significance assessment is approved by the SHPD, or when the SHPD itself makes a significance determination for a cultural resource. The following significance recommendations for archaeological cultural resources are included in this AIS report for the review and concurrence of the SHPD, per the project's PA.

Seven newly-identified cultural resources and 10 previously-identified cultural resources were documented during the City Center AIS. Two additional previously-identified cultural resources were not observed during the current AIS but were in close proximity to the project area corridor and potentially could be affected by project construction so have been included in this discussion. Table 95 lists all cultural resources documented within the City Center AIS along with their significance assessment(s) and mitigation recommendation(s), and the significance of each cultural resource is detailed in the following paragraphs.

Table 95. Archaeological Cultural Resource Significance and Mitigation Recommendations

SIHP # ¹	City Center Test Excavation #(s)	Formal Type/Description	Significance / Eligibility ²		Integrity ³ (Yes/No)							Mitigation Recommendation
			Hawaii Register	National Register	Location	Design	Setting	Materials	Workmanship	Feeling	Association	
50-80-14-7425	T-020	Subsurface fire feature remnant (interpreted as the remains of a single <i>imu</i> or earth oven)	D	D	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-7426	T-054 through T-082, and T-085	Subsurface wetland deposit	D	D	Y	N	N	Y	N	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-7506	T-064, T-066, and T-067	Subsurface incinerated trash deposit	D	D	Y	N	N	Y	N	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-5368	T-088, 091, 092, 093, and 094	Subsurface remnants of Kūwili Fishpond	<u>D</u>	<u>D</u>	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-5966	T-095 within fishpond boundaries but no fishpond sediments observed	Subsurface remnants of Kawa Fishpond	<u>D</u>	<u>D</u>	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	Data Recovery and Monitoring
50-80-14-7427	T-096 through T-101, and Test Bores C-1 to C-6	Subsurface infrastructure remnants, cultural deposits, and human skeletal element	D and E	D	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	Data Recovery, Monitoring, and Burial Treatment
50-80-14-7428	T-119, 119A, 120, 120A, and 120B	Subsurface cultural deposit and historic building foundations	D	D	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	Data Recovery and Monitoring
50-80-14-2963	T-122, T-123, T-124, and Test Bore T-124A	Subsurface cultural deposit, pond sediments, human burials, animal burials	D and E ³	D	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	Data Recovery and Monitoring
50-80-14-7124	T-132	Subsurface infrastructure remnants	<u>Previous: A and D</u>	D	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	Monitoring

SIHP # ¹	City Center Test Excavation #(s)	Formal Type/Description	Significance / Eligibility ²		Integrity ³ (Yes/No)						Mitigation Recommendation	
			Hawaii Register	National Register	Location	Design	Setting	Materials	Workmanship	Feeling		Association
			Recommended: D only									
50-80-14-7189	T-130, 132,134, 138, 140, 231A, 232, and 232A	Subsurface burnt trash deposit	<u>Previous: A and D</u> Recommended: D only	D	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-7190	T-229 and T-230	Subsurface salt pan remnants	<u>Previous: A and D</u> Recommended: D only	D	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	Data Recovery and Monitoring
50-80-14-7197	Not observed in current AIS, but potentially affected by project construction due to close proximity	Subsurface cultural deposit and fire pit feature	<u>Previous: A and D</u> Recommended: D only	D	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-5820	T-141, 142, 145, 146A, 150, 151, and 151A ;T-140, T-143, T-144, T-146, T-147, T-148, T-148A, T-149, and T-152 are included in the SIHP #-5820 interpolated boundary	Subsurface cultural deposit, human burials	D and E	D	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	Data Recovery, Monitoring, and Burial Treatment
50-80-14-7429	T-167, 168, 168A, 168B, 169, 170, and 170A	Subsurface cultural deposit, human skeletal element	D and E	D	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N	N	Data Recovery, Monitoring, and Burial Treatment

SIHP # ¹	City Center Test Excavation #(s)	Formal Type/Description	Significance / Eligibility ²		Integrity ³ (Yes/No)							Mitigation Recommendation
			Hawaii Register	National Register	Location	Design	Setting	Materials	Workmanship	Feeling	Association	
50-80-14-6856	T-181 through T-185	Subsurface remnants of Kolowalu Fishpond	D	D	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-6636	T-186 through T-193, 195, 196, 198 through T-200, 202, 202A, 203, 205, 207, 208, T-210 through T-212, 214, 219, and T-220	Subsurface Kewalo wetland deposit	<u>Previous: A</u> and <u>D</u> Recommended: D	D	Y	N	N	Y	N	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-7430	T-202	Subsurface privy remnant	D	D	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-7193	T-214	Subsurface trash deposit	<u>Previous: Ineligible</u> Recommended: D	D	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-2918	T-226A, B, C, and D, T-227 and T-227A	Subsurface cultural deposit, human burials	D and E	D	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	Data Recovery, Monitoring, and Burial Treatment

¹ Bold SIHP #s are newly identified in the City Center AIS

² Underlined significance criteria indicate eligibility already determined during past historic preservation review; no underlining indicates eligibility is recommended based on past documentation and/or current AIS investigation results

³ Assessed based on the guidance and definitions from National Register Bulletin #15, "How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation"

⁴ For burials described in Clark (1987); no human remains/burials documented for SIHP #-2963 during the current AIS

SIHP #50-80-14-7425, a subsurface fire feature remnant (interpreted as the remains of a single *imu* or earth oven), is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of National Register Bulletin No. 15, SIHP #-7425 retains its integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship. SIHP #-7425 has provided, and could potentially provide additional, information regarding the style and use of pre-Contact fire features (*imu* pits).

SIHP #50-80-14-7426, a subsurface wetland deposit, is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of National Register Bulletin No. 15, SIHP #-7426 retains its integrity of location and materials. SIHP #-7426 has provided, and could potentially provide, additional information regarding the geographic distribution/extent, paleoenvironment, and cultural modification of the pre- and post-Contact wetlands of coastal Kapālama.

SIHP #50-80-14-7506, a subsurface incinerated trash deposit, is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of National Register Bulletin No. 15, SIHP #-7506 retains its integrity of location and materials. SIHP #-7506 has provided, and can potentially provide additional, information related to the geographic distribution and materials of twentieth century refuse disposal and land reclamation efforts in the East Kapālama Geographic Zone.

SIHP #50-80-14-5368, the subsurface remnants of Kūwili Fishpond originally documented by McGerty et al. (1997) and subsequently documented by Athens and Ward (1997), Hammatt et al. (2008), and during the current AIS, was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This Based on the guidance of National Register Bulletin No. 15, SIHP #-5368 retains its integrity of location, materials, and workmanship. SIHP #-5368 has provided, and can potentially provide, additional information on the formation, construction, depositional sequence, characteristics, and geographic extent of Kūwili Fishpond.

SIHP #50-80-14-5966, the subsurface remnants of Kawa Fishpond documented by McDermott and Mann (2001), was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of National Register Bulletin No. 15, SIHP #-5966 retains its location, materials, and workmanship. SIHP #-5966 has provided, and can potentially provide, additional information on the formation, construction, depositional sequence, and contents of Kawa Fishpond.

SIHP #50-80-14-7427, subsurface infrastructure remnants, cultural deposits, and a human skeletal element, is recommended eligible under Criterion D (has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important for research on prehistory or history) and E (has cultural significance to an ethnic group) of the Hawai'i Register, and Criterion D of the National Register, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of the National Register Bulletin No.15, SIHP #-7427 retains its integrity of location, materials, and workmanship. SIHP #-7427 has provided, and can potentially provide, additional information on nineteenth and twentieth century habitation at the previous settlement of Kou and historic development of the area surrounding Honolulu Harbor.

SIHP #50-80-14-7428, a subsurface cultural deposit and historic building foundation, is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of the National Register Bulletin No.15, SIHP #-7428 retains its integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship. It has provided, and can potentially provide, additional information on late pre- to early post-Contact habitation and historic land use within Kaka'ako.

SIHP #50-80-14-2963, a subsurface cultural deposit, pond sediments, human burials, and animal burials originally identified by Ota and Kam (1982) and subsequently by Clark (1987) and during the current AIS, was previously recommended eligible under Criterion D (has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important for research on prehistory or history) and E (has cultural significance to an ethnic group) of the Hawai'i Register, and Criterion D of the National Register, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of National Register Bulletin No. 15, SIHP #-2963 retains its integrity of location, materials, and workmanship. SIHP #-2963 has provided, and can potentially provide, additional information on late pre- to early post-Contact habitation, historic land use including pond infilling, pre- and/or post-Contact burial practices, and pond aquaculture within Kaka'ako.

SIHP #50-80-14-7124, subsurface infrastructure remnants originally documented by Pammer et al. (2011) and subsequently documented during the current AIS, was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Criterion A (associated with events that have made an important contribution to the broad patterns of our history) and D (has yielded, or is likely to yield information important for research on prehistory or history). Based on the results of the current archaeological inventory survey, and in consultation with the State Historic Preservation Division, CSH recommends that SIHP #-7124 does not convey its significance under Criterion A of both the Hawai'i and National Register. The structural remnants have been completely altered by historic to modern land reclamation and urban development. Accordingly, CSH recommends that this cultural resource maintains the integrity to support its historic significance only under Criterion D of the Hawai'i Register and recommends eligibility to the National Register under Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of the National Register Bulletin No.15, SIHP #-7124 retains its integrity of location, materials, and workmanship. SIHP #-7124 has provided, and can potentially provide, additional information on twentieth century habitation and former commercial infrastructure within Kaka'ako.

SIHP #50-80-14-7189, a subsurface burnt trash deposit originally identified by Pammer et al. (2011) and subsequently identified during the current AIS, was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Criterion A (associated with events that have made an important contribution to the broad patterns of our history) and D (has yielded, or is likely to yield information important for research on prehistory or history). Based on the results of the current archaeological inventory survey, and in consultation with the State Historic Preservation Division, CSH recommends that SIHP #-7189 does not convey its significance under Criterion A of both the Hawai'i and National Register. Accordingly, CSH recommends that this cultural resource maintains the integrity to support its historic significance only under Criterion D of the Hawai'i Register and recommends eligibility to the National Register only under Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of the National Register Bulletin No.15, SIHP #-7189 retains its integrity of location, design, and materials. SIHP #-7189 has

provided, and can potentially provide, additional information on nineteenth to early twentieth century material goods and early to mid-twentieth century land reclamation efforts.

SIHP #50-80-14-7190, subsurface salt pan remnants originally identified by Pammer, et al. (2011) and subsequently identified during the current AIS, was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Criterion A (associated with events that have made an important contribution to the broad patterns of our history) and D (has yielded, or is likely to yield information important for research on prehistory or history). Based on the results of the current archaeological inventory survey, and in consultation with the State Historic Preservation Division, CSH recommends that SIHP #-7190 does not convey its significance under Criterion A of both the Hawai'i and National Register. The salt pan remnants have been completely altered by historic to modern land reclamation and urban development. Accordingly, CSH recommends that this cultural resource maintains the integrity to support its historic significance only under Criterion D of the Hawai'i Register and recommends eligibility to the National Register under Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of the National Register Bulletin No.15, SIHP #-7190 retains its integrity of location, materials, and workmanship. SIHP #-7190 has provided, and can potentially provide, additional information the construction, content, and distribution of buried salt pan remnants within Kaka'ako.

SIHP #50-80-14-7197, a subsurface cultural deposit and fire pit feature that was identified by Pammer et al. (2011), was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Criterion A (associated with events that have made an important contribution to the broad patterns of our history) and D (has yielded, or is likely to yield information important for research on prehistory or history) by Pammer et al. (2011). Based on the results of the current archaeological inventory survey, and in consultation with the State Historic Preservation Division, CSH recommends that SIHP #-7197 does not to convey its significance under Criterion A of both the Hawai'i and National Register. SIHP #-7197 has been completely altered by historic and modern fill, grading, and development. Accordingly, CSH recommends that this cultural resource maintains the integrity to support its historic significance only under Criterion D of the Hawai'i Register and recommends eligibility to the National Register under Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of the National Register Bulletin No.15, SIHP #-7197 retains its integrity of location, design, and materials. SIHP #-7197 has provided and could potentially provide additional information on late pre- to early post-Contact land use within Kaka'ako.

SIHP #50-80-14-5820, a subsurface cultural deposit and human burials originally identified by Winieski and Hammatt (2000) and subsequently during the current AIS, was previously recommended eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Criterion D (has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important for research on prehistory or history) and E (has cultural significance to an ethnic group), and Criterion D of the National Register, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of the National Register Bulletin No.15, SIHP #-5820 retains its integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship. SIHP #-5820 has provided, and can potentially provide, additional information on late pre- to early post-Contact habitation, historic land use, and pre- and post-Contact burial practices and distribution within Kaka'ako.

SIHP #50-80-14-7429, a subsurface cultural deposit and human skeletal element, is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Criterion D (has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important for research on prehistory or history) and E (has cultural significance to an ethnic group), and Criterion D of the National Register, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of the National Register Bulletin No. 15, SIHP #-7429 retains its integrity of location, design, and materials. SIHP #-7429 has provided, and can potentially provide, additional information on late pre- to early post-Contact habitation, historic land use, and pre- and post-Contact burial practices and distribution within Kaka'ako.

SIHP #50-80-14-6856, the subsurface remnants of Kolowalu Fishpond originally identified by Bell et al. (2006) and subsequently identified by O'Hare et al. (2006), Thurman et al. (2009), and during the current AIS, was previously recommended eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Criterion D (has yielded, or is likely to yield information important for research on prehistory or history) by Bell et al. (2006). CSH recommends that SIHP #-6856 maintains the integrity to support its historic significance under Criterion D of the Hawai'i Register and recommends eligibility to the National Register under Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of National Register Bulletin No. 15, SIHP #-6856 retains its integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship. SIHP #-6856 has provided, and can potentially provide, additional information on the formation, construction, depositional sequence, and contents of Kolowalu Fishpond.

SIHP #50-80-14-6636, a subsurface Kewalo wetland deposit originally documented by O'Hare et al. (2003) and subsequently identified by O'Hare et al. (2004), Tulchin and Hammatt (2005), Clark and Gosser (2005), Hammatt (2008), Altizer et al. (2011), Runyon et al. (2011), and Morriss et al. (2013), was documented during the current AIS. SIHP #-6636 was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Criterion A (associated with events that have made an important contribution to the broad patterns of our history) and D (has yielded, or is likely to yield information important for research on prehistory or history). Based on the results of the current archaeological inventory survey, and in consultation with the State Historic Preservation Division, CSH recommends that SIHP #-6636 does not convey its significance under Criterion A of both the Hawai'i and National Register. The former land surface and its potential features (i.e., berms, ponds, and other cultural components) are buried and their surroundings have been completely altered by modern development since their time of construction and period of use. Accordingly, CSH recommends that this cultural resource maintains the integrity to support its historic significance only under Criterion D of the Hawai'i Register and recommends eligibility to the National Register under Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of National Register Bulletin No. 15, SIHP # 6636 retains its integrity of location and materials. SIHP #-6636 has provided, and can potentially provide, additional information on pre-Contact to early twentieth century habitation and agricultural and aquacultural use of the former Kewalo wetland surface.

SIHP #50-80-14-7430, a subsurface privy remnant, is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D (has yielded, or is likely to yield information important for research on prehistory or history). Based on the guidance of the National Register Bulletin No. 15, SIHP #-7430 retains its integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship. SIHP #-7430 has provided, and can potentially provide information

related to the location, design, and contents of historic privies within Kālia and the surrounding area.

SIHP #50-80-14-7193, a subsurface trash deposit originally identified by Burke and Hammatt (2012) and subsequently identified during the current AIS, was previously determined ineligible to the Hawai'i Register. However, SIHP #7193 buried trash deposit maintains the same integrity of location, design, and materials as SIHP # 50-80-14-7189. Based on the results of the current City Center AIS study, and in consultation with SHPD, CSH recommends that SIHP #7193 retains sufficient integrity to recommend eligibility to both the Hawai'i Register and the National Register under Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential.

SIHP #50-80-14-2918, a subsurface cultural deposit and human burials originally identified by Yent (1985) with additional components identified during the current City Center AIS, is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i Register under under Criteria D (has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important for research on prehistory or history) and E (has cultural significance to an ethnic group), and Criterion D of the National Register, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the guidance of National Register Bulletin No. 15, SIHP #-2918 retains its integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship. SIHP #-2918 has provided, and can potentially provide, additional information on late pre- to early post-Contact habitation, historic land use, and pre- and post-Contact burial practices and distribution within Kaka'ako.