

Meeting Summary

Aloha Stadium Station Focus Meeting

Date and Time: **March 13, 2014, 10:00 a.m.**

Location: **Ali'i Place, 1099 Alakea Street, Honolulu, HI 96813**

The following materials are attached to these minutes:

- Appendix A Agenda
- Appendix B PowerPoint Presentation
- Appendix C Historic Architect Review of Aloha Stadium Station (distributed via the email meeting reminder on March 6)

Welcome and Introductions

Facilitator initiated roundtable introductions. Federal Transit Administration (FTA) opened the meeting and welcomed attendees.

Meeting Purpose

FTA stated that the purpose of the meeting was to begin a process to respond to Historic Hawaii Foundation (HHF) objection that the Honolulu Authority for Rapid Transportation (HART) is in breach of Programmatic Agreement (PA) Stipulation IV. HHF's objections are articulated in its January 2014 letter to FTA.

Background

HART provided a summary background of the Aloha Stadium Station from the Draft Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) in which the Station included a station entrance/touchdown that was on the makai side of Kamehameha Highway and within the U.S. Naval Base Pearl Harbor National Historic Landmark (NHL) boundary. Pursuant to specific comments by the State Historic Preservation Division (SHPD) that the station touchdown would directly impact the NHL, the Final EIS mitigation measures resulted in the entrance/touchdown within the NHL being eliminated. The station is now located entirely on the mauka side of Kamehameha Highway, on the Aloha Stadium property and outside of the NHL boundary.

The PA requires HART to conduct at a minimum two neighborhood design workshops per station group and to notify the consulting parties of the workshops and consider any comments (Stipulation IV.B). In addition to the design workshops, HART also held focus meetings with the CPs for stations with historic sensitivities prior to community presentation. A station group presentation and station focus meeting was held on October 3, 2013 with CPs, and the neighborhood design workshop was held on October 8, 2013. [Note: federal agencies were furloughed when these meetings occurred]

At the station group presentation the SOI qualified Architect, Minatoishi Architects provided a presentation of the summary of impacts of the Aloha Stadium Station. Minatoishi Architects contracted by Final Designer Anil Verma came on board in the fall of 2013. Minatoishi Architects determined that the SOI standards are not applicable to the Aloha Stadium Station because neither the station nor the Stadium are historic properties. The station is neither within or directly adjacent to a historic property as provided for in the PA, Stipulation IV.A. Consequently, SOI Treatment of Historic Properties including Restoration, Rehabilitation, Reconstruction and/or Adaptive Reuse Guidelines do not apply. As a result, the SOI standards cannot be used as a mitigation tool. The guidelines are meant to be applied to historic properties. The station is *new construction* thus the SOI standards are not applicable.

SOI-Architect Presentation

Minatoishi Architects presented the very same PowerPoint (Appendix B) that was presented at the October 3 meeting, which included present-day site conditions, views to the NHL from the Aloha Stadium property and Aloha Stadium, views from the bus stop on the makai side of Kamehameha Highway, views from the Ford Island Bridge and security guardhouse, and the Arizona Memorial. The presentation also included the significance of the NHL's eligibility to the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) and an overview of SOI treatment of historic properties. The project has no direct impact on the NHL and it does not directly or indirectly affect the elements of the NHL that form the basis of the NHL's eligibility to the NRHP.

Current Mitigation Measures:

- Elimination of touchdown within the NHL
- Historic American Building Survey (HABS), Historic American Engineering Record (HAER), and Historic American Landscape Survey (HALS) Recordation documentation (Stipulation V.C)
- NRHP nominations forms (Stipulation VI)
- Educational and Interpretive Programs, Materials, and Signage (Stipulation VII)

Design Constraints:

- Guideway alignment
- Station location
- Aloha Stadium Authority requirements and operations
- U.S. Navy security measures
 - Visual security screen on makai side of station to prevent views to and pictures of the NHL

COMMENTS:

Noting the alignment shift at Kaka'ako Station, NTHP asked for clarification on the parameters of any alignment modification; proposed shifting the station further 'ewa to where it is either over Salt Lake Blvd. or entirely within the Aloha Stadium parking lot on the mauka side of Sale Lake Blvd.

National Park Service (NPS) asked for clarification on the boundary of the NHL in relationship to the station. The NHL boundary is adjacent to Kamehameha Highway, which traverses between the NHL boundary and the Aloha Stadium property.

SHPD asked for relationship between Station location and area of potential effect (APE).

Design Mitigation Proposals:

- Concrete color coatings
- Colored metal panels along stairs
- Materials for louvered Visual Security Screens
- At-grade landscaping

Discussion of "Directly Adjacent" as it relates to the PA Stipulation IV.A and Aloha Stadium Station:

There were clear differences in opinion amongst the group on the definition of adjacency, as provided for in PA, Stipulation IV.A. There was also confusion on the inconsistent listing of stations in the various HART documents that the SOI standard would apply to. Thus, there was an agreement that to facilitate a process to respond to HHF's objections, rather than focusing on the interpretation of "directly adjacent to," that it would be more productive to agree on a list of stations that the SOI standards would apply to. To further facilitate that

listing, HART would circulate a list of stations that the SOI standards would apply to for review and comment by the CPs. To ensure that everyone was informed of this action, once the CPs reviewed the list, HART would post on their website the list of stations that the SOI standards would apply to.

COMMENTS:

NPS noted that the Pearl Harbor NHL Nomination form doesn't exclude land.

HHF is adamant that the station is directly adjacent to the NHL and asked that FTA and HART just concur that the standards will be applied.

FTA reiterates that the PA states "directly adjacent". "Directly" implies that there are no intervening features. Treating the term too flexibly will create unworkable situations and there must be a standard and qualifying factors so it's clear when there is non-compliance with the PA. As a matter of process, the determination must be documented. FTA clarified that they would like to comply with the spirit of the HHF letter and asked what impacts are not being addressed and what mitigation is proposed.

NTHP asked if the SOI standards would be applicable if Kamehameha were a 2-lane or 4-lane highway. NTHP agreed that there were not any extreme adverse effects, however, the principle of what "directly adjacent" may mean is more important.

SHPD commented that the PA should've defined "directly adjacent"; perhaps a more useful definition would've considered "a specific contributing resource to a district". Commented that it is difficult to understand exactly how the SOI standards will be applied to this station but recommends applying the standards to the limit. SHPD believes that the station is adjacent to the NHL – four-lane highway or not – but as Minatoishi Architects presented, the slope issues and distance from the specific qualities that form the significance of the NHL's eligibility on the register should be taken in to consideration.

ACHP commented that for lessons-learned and for clarity, the stations should've been listed. Any changes in personnel should require written confirmation from FTA to the CPs. ACHP hopes for there to be specific and substantive discussion today: how does the station fit within the context and what can we further do to make it better relate to the NHL?

The Navy agreed that the focus should be on how the group can work together to apply the SOI standards.

List of Stations

Multiple versions of a list of stations applicable to SOI standards was circulated to CPs, the latest having occurred on February 19, 2013 in which no CPs objected, and included the following stations:

1. Pearl Highlands
2. Aloha Stadium
3. Pearl Harbor Naval Base
4. Kalihi
5. Kapālama
6. Iwilei
7. Chinatown
8. Downtown

COMMENTS:

Minatoishi Architects suggests the historic architect be included in the design efforts. There is disconnect when they have to analyze later on in the process without a complete understanding of the concept and how the design may have evolved.

Kuiwalu suggests a spreadsheet that includes the list of the stations along with potential mitigation measures.

ACTION ITEMS:

HART will recirculate the list as a way to formalize it, solicit comments on the impacts from CPs and schedule a meeting to reconvene on the topic. The list will be available on the project website for the record and public notice.

Treatment Plan

The station is *new construction*. As triggered by Stipulation IV., a treatment plan to minimize and mitigate adverse effects is the next step.

COMMENTS:

HHF noted that the PA requires the treatment plan be developed through a consultative process.

FTA added that they are looking forward to moving forward and asked what the impacts are so they can be addressed.

Closing Remarks/Adjournment

Next meeting scheduled for March 19 at 8am Hawaii time where the treatment plan will be discussed. ACHP stated that they are unsure if there will be representation at the next meeting.

*** Meeting adjourned at approximately 12:20pm ***

Attending Consulting Parties & Signatories

Betsy Merritt	National Trust for Historic Preservation
Blythe Semmer	Advisory Council on Historic Preservation (ACHP) (<i>dial-in</i>)
Charlene Vaughn	ACHP (<i>dial-in</i>)
Charlene Oka-Wong	NAVFAC HI, Navy Region Hawai'i
Elaine Jackson-Retondo	National Park Service (NPS)
Elizabeth Patel	Federal Transit Administration (FTA) (<i>dial-in</i>)
Jeffrey Dodge	NAVFAC HI, Navy Region Hawai'i
Jerry Norris	Office of Hawaiian Affairs (<i>dial-in</i>)
Kiersten Faulkner	Historic Hawai'i Foundation (HHF)
Mary Nguyen	FTA (<i>dial-in</i>)
Melia-Lane Kamahale	NPS
Mike Gushard	State Historic Preservation Division (SHPD)
Ray Sukys	FTA (<i>dial-in</i>)
Susan Lebo	SHPD
Tanya Gumarac-McGuire	HHF
Ted Matley	FTA (<i>dial-in</i>)

Attending Project Staff

Brennon Morioka	HART
Dawn Chang	Kuiwalu
Gary Omori	Gary Omori
Jay McRae	CH2M Hill
Joe Lapilio	Na Kii Ku
Josh Silva	CH2M Hill
Kathleen Chu	CH2M Hill
Ken Caswell	Honolulu Authority for Rapid Transportation (HART)
Liz Scanlon	HART
Lisa Kahahane	Pacific Legacy, Inc.
Lorraine Minatoishi	Minatoishi Architects
Mike Yoshida	HART
Paul Luersen	CH2M Hill
Stan Solamillo	HART

Appendix A

Agenda

Appendix B

PowerPoint Presentation

Appendix C

Historic Architect Review of Aloha Stadium Station