From:	Sukys, Raymond (FTA)
To:	Luu, Catherine (FTA)
CC:	Mantych, Timothy; Barr, James (FTA); VanWyk, Christopher (FTA); Marler, Renee (FTA); Matley, Ted (FTA); Zusman, Nancy-Ellen (FTA); Carranza, Edward (FTA); Rogers, Leslie (FTA); Ryan, James (FTA); Tahir, Nadeem (FTA)
Sent:	1/15/2010 7:38:32 AM
Subject:	Alternative Alignments to avoid impacting HNL and Keehi Lagoon Park
Attachments:	Airport Alig Altern Concept Estimate.tif; hnl airport - Google Maps.mht

During the January 13th meeting with the FAA, the City began with a pitch for their preferred alternative along Aolele Street. The City also presented alternatives that avoid impacting airport operations and Keehi Lagoon Park. There are 3 feasible alternatives that have various pros and cons which avoid impacting airport operations and the park. One alternative would be to use Aolele Street to cross over surface parking to Ualena Street. This avoids impacting airport operations, does a better job than the City's preferred alternative of avoiding the park but has various private takes near the park and near the station at Lagoon. Koapaka Street is further from airport operations, does a better job of avoiding the park than Ualena Street and has fewer private takes. Adjacent to the H1 viaduct is the least preferred from a constructability sense but it avoids the park in a slightly better way than Koapaka and seems to have minimal other takes.

Rank order of impacts

	Airport	Private	Park
City's preferred alternative - Aelole	4	1	4
Aelole/Ualena	1*	4	3
Koapaka	1*	3	1**
Adjacent to H1	1*	2	1**

* tied - completely avoids airport operations
** nearly the same but Koapaka intrudes more
1 would be the least amount of impacts, 4 the most.

The City provided some rough cost estimates. The City's preferred option is the lowest cost at $20M. Aelole/Ualena and Koapaka range from $55M to $104M. The estimates are in the attachment. Adjacent to H1 does not have a current estimate but is considered far more expensive than the others because of the narrowness of the alignment and required stacking of the guideway. Adjacent to H1 is least preferred by the City due to constructability issues. Generally, FAA was skeptical of these costs and I suggested that FTA's PMOC take a look. The FAA requested of the City more information on local takes for these alternatives.

Cathy, please direct the PMOC to review the City's cost estimates to determine whether the costs are reasonable. Please provide an opinion on narrowing the City's wide-range of costs. Also, is the City's estimating approach is appropriate and consistent with the rest of the alignment. The City has drawings which should be obtained from Jim Dunn.

Thank you,

Ray

From: Hogan, Steven [mailto:Hogan@pbworld.com]
Sent: Tuesday, January 12, 2010 1:46 PM
To: Sukys, Raymond (FTA)
Cc: Miyamoto, Faith; Souki, Jesse K.; Spurgeon, Lawrence; Dunn, James
Subject: FW: Conceptual Estimate for Airport Alternative Alignments

Hi Ray. Here is some of the information we've developed for the design options at the Airport. We can discuss these tomorrow in the meeting with the FAA. The graphics, as we said, are too large to email, so we'll bring them with us (including electronic versions) to talk from. Please share this with Kathy. I don't have her email address. Hope this helps a little. Thanks!

Steve Hogan
Parsons Brinckerhoff

808-768-6133
602-820-8056 cell

From: Dunn, James
Sent: Tuesday, January 12, 2010 11:26 AM
To: Hogan, Steven
Subject: Concetual Estimate for Airport Alternative Alignments

Steve

Attached is estimate info you requested.

Jim

NOTICE: This communication and any attachments ("this message") may contain confidential information for the sole use of the intended recipient(s). Any unauthorized use, disclosure, viewing, copying, alteration, dissemination or distribution of, or reliance on this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, or you are not an authorized recipient, please notify the sender immediately by replying to this message, delete this message and all copies from your e-mail system and destroy any printed copies.