

Pacific Legacy

Historic
Preservation

ANNUAL REPORT
OF THE
KĀKOʻO
January - December 2014



CULTURAL RESOURCES CONSULTANTS

Hawai'i Offices:

Kailua, O'ahu
Hilo, Hawai'i

California Offices:

Business Office
Bay Area
Inland Empire
Sierra/Central Valley

Pacific Legacy: Exploring the past, informing the present, enriching the future.

ANNUAL REPORT
OF THE
KĀKO‘O
January - December 2014

Prepared by:
Paul L. Cleghorn, Ph.D.
Kāko‘o

Pacific Legacy, Inc.
30 Aulike Street, Suite 301
Kailua, HI 96734
(808) 263-4800

Prepared for:
Honolulu Authority for Rapid Transit
and
U.S. Department of Transportation Federal Transit Administration

February 2015

MANAGEMENT SUMMARY

The Programmatic Agreement (PA) among the U.S. Department of Transportation Federal Transit Administration, the Hawai‘i State Historic Preservation Officer, the United States Navy, and the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation regarding the Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project in the City and County of Honolulu, Hawai‘i required the City and County of Honolulu to fund an independent PA Project Manager (Kāko‘o) to assist with the coordination of all reviews and deliverables required under the terms of the PA. Pacific Legacy was contracted in March 2012 by the Honolulu Authority for Rapid Transit (HART) to undertake the role of the Kāko‘o.

Stipulation I.H.1-12 of the PA outlines the roles and responsibilities of the Kāko‘o. The purpose of the present report is to describe the activities and actions of the Kāko‘o during the last 12 months toward fulfilling the roles and responsibilities as prescribed in the PA. It will be seen in this short report that there has been a tremendous amount of effort expended in the past 12 months (January - December 2014) relating to the identification, evaluation, and treatment of Historic Properties that are within the Area of Potential Effect (APE) of the rail project. The Kāko‘o has been thoroughly involved in these efforts, helping to ensure that work is done at the highest caliber.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION.....	3
MONTHLY MEETING SERIES.....	3
NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES NOMINATION REVIEWS.....	4
HISTORIC CONTEXT STUDIES.....	5
ALOHA STADIUM STATION.....	5
INDIRECT AND CUMULATIVE EFFECTS	6
TERMINATION OF PACIFIC LEGACY AS KĀKO‘O	6
MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS	7

Frontispiece: Artistic rendering of HART rail cars.

INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this report is present a summary of the activities and actions taken by the Kāko‘o between January 2014 and December 2014. The Kāko‘o position was filled by Pacific Legacy in March 2012. The roles and responsibilities of the Kāko‘o are outlined in Stipulation I.H. of the Programmatic Agreement among the U.S. Department of Transportation Federal Transit Administration, the Hawai‘i State Historic Preservation Officer, the United States Navy, and the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation regarding the Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project in the City and County of Honolulu, Hawai‘i. The activities of the Kāko‘o for 2012-2013 were covered in a formal report previously prepared in February 2014 by the Kāko‘o for the Honolulu Authority for Rapid Transit and the U.S. Department of Transportation Federal Transit Administration.

MONTHLY MEETING SERIES

Regular meetings with PA signatories and consulting parties were carried out on a monthly basis throughout 2014 with two exceptions – the January meeting was not convened because this was when the annual PA meeting occurred, and the September meeting was cancelled because of scheduling and planning conflicts.

The format of the monthly meeting was modified from the previous years, with HART staff members attending and having an active role in developing the agenda for the meetings. Direct HART participation was deemed a positive move, so that signatories and consulting parties could direct questions to those staff member who either had the answers or knew who to contact for the needed answers.

The following is a synopsis of topics covered in these meetings.

February 2014

- Annual Meeting Minutes & Summary
- City Center Stations Preliminary Engineering Workshop

March 2014

- Aloha Stadium Design Workshop

April 2014

- Summary of FTA visit during the week of 14 April 2014
- Aloha Stadium Design Workshop

May 2014

- Project Update
- Context Studies Update
- Historic Preservation Fund Update
- Current Preliminary Designs for Stations: Civic Center, Kaka‘ako, and Ala Moana

June 2014

- Pearl Harbor Station - Context and Design
- Holau Market – poster project for Hawaiian and immigrant history during the Territorial Period
- Six month evaluation of Consulting Party meeting schedule

July 2014

- Chinatown Station Plaza on Kekaulike Street Update
- Historic Preservation Fund Update
- General Project Updates

August 2014

- General Project Updates
- Aloha Stadium Station Status
- Makalapa National Register Forms Status
- Evaluating the Role of the Kāko‘o

October 2014

- Developing a POAM (Plan of Action and Milestones)

November 2014

- Continue Discussion of POAM (Plan of Action and Milestones)

December 2014

Two meetings took place:

FTA MEETING

- FTA led discussion on proposed actions to address Reasonably Foreseeable Indirect and Cumulative Effects Caused by the Project

KĀKO‘O MEETING

- Continue Discussion of POAM (Plan of Action and Milestones)

NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES NOMINATION REVIEWS

Draft versions of the following two NRHP nominations forms were reviewed:

- Naval Housing Area Makalapa, U.S. Naval Base Pearl Harbor (Makalapa)
- Civilian Housing Area Makalapa, U.S. Naval Base Pearl Harbor (Little Makalapa)

Pre-draft and draft versions of these two nominations were reviewed by Kāko‘o team members:

Paul L. Cleghorn, Ph.D.
Wendy L. Tinsley Becker, RPT, AICP
Virginia D. Murison, AIA

Review comments were provided to HART regarding the appropriateness of one versus two nominations, as well as specifics on descriptions of features, and the applicability of significance criteria. These comments were used in the re-drafting of these nominations forms that have been submitted to the State Historic Preservation Division for review.

HISTORIC CONTEXT STUDIES

Related to the reviews of the above NRHP nomination forms, as well as Historic American Building Survey (HABS)/Historic American Engineering Record (HAER)/Historic American Landscape Survey (HALS) studies, HART is responsible for the development of Historic Context Studies related to relevant historic themes for the project. The Kāko‘o reviewed drafts of these context studies and submitted comments to HART to assist in the revision of these studies.

ALOHA STADIUM STATION

Considerable time and effort was expended in 2014 regarding the effects the Aloha Stadium Station would have on the Pearl Harbor National Historic Landmark (PHNHL). Serious arguments were made by several of the consulting parties that the construction of this Station would have an adverse effect on the PHNHL and that HART must meet the terms of PA Stipulation IV.A and comply with the Secretary of Interior’s (SOI) Standards as they relate to making “every reasonable effort to avoid adverse effect[s] on historic properties.” HART affirmed that Stipulation IV.A applies to Aloha Stadium Station due to its relationship to the PHNHL and indicated that the SOI Standards could be applied, and that a treatment plan needed to be developed to provide the mechanism for compliance with Stipulation IV.A. The Kāko‘o (P. Cleghorn, W. Tinsley Becker, and V. Murison) assisted in resolving issues surrounding this treatment plan and a final treatment plan has been produced.

INDIRECT AND CUMULATIVE EFFECTS

In October 2014, the Historic Hawai'i Foundation (HHF) notified the FTA and the Kāko'o of a significant adverse effect to the Honolulu Advertiser Building and requested FTA to "call a meeting of the consulting parties to discuss what next steps would be appropriate under the new circumstances to mitigate the effects on this historic resource" as per Stipulation IX.D of the PA.

HHF also noted that the Kāko'o has the following responsibilities as per Stipulation IX.10:

. . . collect any comments from the consulting parties that identify impacts different from those stated in this PA to historic properties located within the APE for City and PTA processing. The Kāko'o shall research the issues presented . . . and prepare a recommendation for the disposition of the request and action by FTA . . .

The Kāko'o sought comments from consulting parties; conducted research on background issues regarding this effect; and met with concerned parties. This work resulted in a letter to FTA recommending courses of action. Since this original notice was made, FTA has met several times with concerned consulting parties and these meetings are on-going. No resolutions have been made.

The issue raised by HHF is larger than the specific effects to a historic property. The larger issue is how to proceed with identifying the potential cumulative and indirect effects not previously identified within the APE of the project. This issue is still being discussed and no solutions have been developed.

TERMINATION OF PACIFIC LEGACY AS KĀKO'O

Pacific Legacy was notified by telephone at the end of September that the contract to provide Kāko'o services to HART would be terminated for convenience. The contract would be terminated by the end of 2014. No written notice was provided.

Since the latter part of September, HART has held meetings with consulting parties on re-defining the role of the Kāko'o. The current Kāko'o was not invited to any of these meetings. A re-definition of the roles and responsibilities of the Kāko'o have been developed and HART is in the process of acquiring a new Kāko'o.

Pacific Legacy has been asked to remain as the Kāko'o until a new Kāko'o can be hired. Pacific Legacy has agreed and the latest termination date has been estimated to be at the end of March 2015.

MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS

- General administrative
 - Prepared monthly status reports to HART
 - Upkeep of CP contact list and periodic distribution to HART
 - Meetings/discussions on Station compliance with SOI to City Center Stations, Kalihi, Kapalama, Iwilei, Chinatown, and Downtown
- Follow-up on billing matters and task orders.
- Prepared evaluation of HART's compliance to the PA (Jan. 2014).
- Drafted Best Practices Manual. Distributed to CPs for comment (1/31/14). No comments received.
- Wrote "Evaluating the Role of the Kāko'o" (see email of 9/2/14).
- Meetings with CPs that had specific concerns.
- Implemented HART's request to provide an agenda for the Kāko'o meetings.
- Kāko'o more often utilized as an information conduit than in the previous year.
- Provided background and supplemental information to CPs, HART, and FTA as requested (e.g., listing of report, plans, and other submittals generated for inclusion in draft POAM; Appendix A of PA requested by HHF; request from Kanehili Cultural Hui about the Historic Preservation Committee).