

Section 7 Significance

The inventory survey investigation and documentation of the study area's archaeological cultural resources have provided sufficient information for significance evaluations (see Cultural Resource Descriptions Section and the following discussion). Cultural resource significance is evaluated and expressed as eligibility for listing on the National and/or Hawai'i Register. To be considered eligible for listing on the National and/or Hawai'i Register a cultural resource should possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and/or association, and meet one or more of the following broad cultural/historic significance criteria (36 CFR 60.4 and HAR Chapter 13-275-6).

- A. Reflects major trends or events in the history of the state or nation
- B. Associated with the lives of persons significant in our past
- C. Excellent example of a site type/work of a master
- D. Has yielded or may be likely to yield information important in prehistory or history
- E. (Hawai'i Register only) has cultural significance to an ethnic group, including, but not limited to, religious structures, burials, and traditional cultural properties

As discussed in Section 1.2, cultural resources are the physical remains and/or geographic locations that reflect the activity, heritage, and/or beliefs of ethnic groups, local communities, states, and/or nations. Generally, they are at least 50 years old (although there are exceptions) and include: buildings and structures; groupings of buildings or structures (historic districts); certain objects; archaeological artifacts, features, sites, and/or deposits; groupings of archaeological sites (archaeological districts); and, in some instances, natural landscape features and/or geographic locations of cultural significance. The current investigation was tasked with the identification of only archaeological cultural resources.

In federal historic preservation legislation, significance determinations (expressed as eligibility to the National Register) are generally made by a federal agency official in consultation with the SHPO. Under Hawai'i State historic preservation legislation, significance determinations (expressed as eligibility to the Hawai'i Register) result when a state agency official's significance assessment is approved by the SHPD, or when the SHPD itself makes a significance determination for a cultural resource. The following significance recommendations for archaeological cultural resources are included in this AIS report for the review and concurrence of the SHPD, per the project's PA.

Six newly identified cultural resources and 10 previously identified cultural resources were documented during the City Center AIS. Two additional previously identified cultural resources were not observed during the current AIS but were in close proximity to the project area corridor and potentially could be affected by project construction so have been included in this discussion. Table 48 lists all cultural resources documented within the City Center AIS along with their significance assessment(s) and mitigation recommendation(s), and the significance of each cultural resource is detailed in the following paragraphs.

Table 48. Archaeological Cultural Resource Significance and Mitigation Recommendations

SIHP # ¹	City Center Test Excavation #(s)	Description/Formal Type	Significance / Eligibility ²		Integrity ³ (Yes/No)							Mitigation Recommendation
			Hawaii Register	National Register	Location	Design	Setting	Materials	Workmanship	Feeling	Association	
50-80-14-7425	T-020	Buried single <i>imu</i> (earth oven) feature	D	D	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-7426	T-054-082, and T-085	Buried agricultural sediments	D	D	Y	N	N	Y	N	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-5368	T-088, 091, 092, 093, and 094	Buried remnants of Kūwili Fishpond	<u>D</u>	<u>D</u>	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-5966	T-095	Buried remnants of Kawa Fishpond	<u>D</u>	<u>D</u>	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-7427	T-096-101	Buried historic building foundations and walls and underlying culturally enriched sediments, also one human talus bone in a fill deposit	D	D	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-7428	T-119, 119A, 120, 120A, 120B	Buried culturally-enriched sand A-horizon (T-120, 120A, and 120B) and historic warehouse foundation (T-119 and 119A)	D	D	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	Data Recovery and Monitoring of sand A-horizon, Monitoring for historic foundation
50-80-14-2963	T-122, 123, and 124	Buried pond sediments containing historic artifacts, culturally-enriched sand A-horizon, also includes 7 human burials as described in the adjacent Makai Parking Garage	D and E ⁴	D	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N	N	Monitoring for pond sediments, Data Recovery and Monitoring for culturally enriched sand A-

SIHP # ¹	City Center Test Excavation #(s)	Description/Formal Type	Significance / Eligibility ²		Integrity ³ (Yes/No)							Mitigation Recommendation	
			Hawaii Register	National Register	Location	Design	Setting	Materials	Workmanship	Feeling	Association		
		monitoring report (Clark 1987)											horizon.
50-80-14-7124	T-132	Buried historic building remnants	<u>Previous: A and D</u> Recommended:D	D	Y	N	N	Y	N	N	N		Monitoring
50-80-14-7189	T-130, 132,134, 138, 140, 231A, 232, and 232A	Buried fill layer containing burnt historic trash from open burning	<u>Previous: A and D</u> Recommended:D	D	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N	N		Monitoring
50-80-14-7190	T-229 and T-230	Buried salt pan remnants	<u>Previous: A and D</u> Recommended:D	D	Y	N	N	Y	Y	N	N		Monitoring
50-80-14-7197	Not observed in current AIS, but potentially affected by project construction due to close proximity	Buried culturally-enriched sand A-horizon	<u>Previous: A and D</u> Recommended:D	D	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N	N		Monitoring
50-80-14-5820	T-141, 142, 145, 146A, 150, 151, 151A	Human skeletal remains/burials and buried culturally enriched sand A-horizon	D and E	D	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N	N		Data Recovery, Monitoring, Burial Treatment
50-80-14-7429	T-167, 168, 168A, 168B, 169, 170, and 170A	Buried subsurface culturally enriched sand A-horizon—and human cranial Fragment in T-	D	D	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N	N		Monitoring

SIHP # ¹	City Center Test Excavation #(s)	Description/Formal Type	Significance / Eligibility ²		Integrity ³ (Yes/No)							Mitigation Recommendation
			Hawaii Register	National Register	Location	Design	Setting	Materials	Workmanship	Feeling	Association	
		170										
50-80-14-6856	T-181-185	Buried remnants of Kolowalu Fishpond	D	D	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-6636	T-186-193, 195, 196, 198-200, 202, 202A, 203, 205, 207, 208, 210-212, 214, 219, and 220	Buried remnants of the former Kewalo wetland land surface	<u>Previous: A and D</u> Recommended:D	D	Y	N	N	Y	N	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-7430	T-202	Buried remnant of a historic privy	D	D	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	Monitoring
50-80-14-7193	T-214	Buried historic refuse-enriched fill deposit	<u>Ineli-gible</u>	Ineli-gible	Y	N	N	Y	N	N	N	N/A
50-80-14-2918	T-226A, B, C, and D, T-227 and 227A	Buried culturally enriched sand A-horizon with human skeletal remains/burials, also includes iron historic trolley or cart tracks	D and E	D	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	Data Recovery, Monitoring, and, Burial Treatment

¹ Bold SIHP #s are newly identified in the City Center AIS

² Underlined significance criteria indicate eligibility already determined during past historic preservation review; no underlining indicates eligibility is recommended based on past documentation and/or current AIS investigation results

³ Assessed based on the guidance and definitions from National Register Bulletin #15, "How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation"

⁴ For burials described in Clark (1987); no human remains/burials documented for SIHP #-2963 during the current AIS

SIHP #50-80-14-7425, a buried, traditional Hawaiian *imu* feature, is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship. It has provided information on materials, construction methods, and form of *imu*, and pre- and post-Contact habitation in coastal Kalihi. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria A, B, or C.

SIHP #50-80-14-7426, buried agricultural sediments, is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location and materials. It has provided information on geographic distribution/extent of the former agricultural surface and paleoenvironmental data about the pre-historic and historic landscape and its modification for the cultivation of rice, taro, and possibly cow peas. Preliminary laboratory results indicate that these agricultural deposits yield a high potential for future environmental and land use/modification studies. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria A, B, or C.

SIHP #50-80-14-7427, buried historic-era building foundations/walls, underlying culturally enriched sediments, and human skeletal remains (a single talus bone found in imported fill deposits), is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location, materials, and workmanship. It has provided information on the historic landscape of the Honolulu Harbor waterfront. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria A, B, or C.

SIHP #50-80-14-7428, a buried, culturally enriched, sand A-horizon and a historic warehouse foundation, is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship. It has provided information on pre- and post-Contact land use in coastal Kaka'ako. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria A, B, or C.

SIHP #50-80-14-7429, a buried, culturally enriched, sand A-horizon and human skeletal remains (isolated cranial fragment in buried sand A-horizon), is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location, design, and materials. It has provided information on pre- and post-Contact habitation in coastal Kewalo. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria A, B, or C.

SIHP #50-80-14-7430, a buried remnant of a historic-era privy, is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship. It has provided information on construction materials, form, and techniques of nineteenth century privies specifically and habitation in historic Waikīkī generally. This buried

archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria A, B, or C.

SIHP #50-80-14-2918, historic-era trolley tracks and a buried, culturally enriched, sand A-horizon with associated human skeletal remains originally identified by Yent (1985) with additional components identified during the current City Center AIS, is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Significance Criteria D and E, for its information content and cultural significance to the native Hawaiian people, respectively, and to the National Register under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship. The components of this cultural resource identified during the current AIS have provided additional information on the geographic extent of the buried A-horizon and associated burials, and laboratory analysis of collected cultural material has provided information on food consumption activities in the area from late pre-Contact through early post-Contact times. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria A, B, or C.

SIHP #50-80-14-2963, is composed of buried, culturally enriched pond sediments, a culturally enriched sand A-horizon, and human skeletal remains originally identified by Clark (1987) [note: not human skeletal remains associated with SIHP #50-80-14-2963 were identified in the current AIS study area]. Additional components of this archaeological cultural resource, with the exception of human skeletal remains, were identified during the current City Center AIS. The cultural resource is recommended eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Significance Criteria D and E, for its information content and cultural significance to the native Hawaiian people, respectively, and to the National Register under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location, materials, and workmanship. The components of this cultural resource identified during the current AIS have provided additional information on the geographic extent of the former subsurface deposits, and laboratory analysis of collected cultural material has provided information on aquaculture, food production, and habitation in the area during pre- and post-Contact times. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria A, B, or C.

SIHP #50-80-14-5368, buried remnants of Kūwili Fishpond originally documented by McGerty, Dega, and Spear (1997) and subsequently documented by Athens and Ward (1997), Hammatt, Hazlett, and Shideler (2008), and during the current AIS, was determined eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. The current investigation found no information to contradict this existing significance determination. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location, materials, and workmanship. It has provided information on the geographical extent of the fishpond, construction materials and methods, and aquacultural practices. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria A, B, or C.

SIHP #50-80-14-5820, human skeletal remains originally documented by Winieski and Hammatt (2000) with additional components (human skeletal remains and an associated buried, culturally enriched A-horizon) identified during the current AIS, is recommended eligible to the

Hawai'i Register under Significance Criteria D and E, for its information content and cultural significance to the native Hawaiian people, respectively, and to the National Register under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location, design, and materials. It has provided information on the geographical extent of the former A-horizon and distribution of human skeletal remains, and laboratory analysis of collected cultural material has provided information on habitation and food production in the area. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria A, B, or C.

Although Test Excavation 95 was excavated within the footprint of SIHP # 50-80-14-5966, Kawa Fishpond, actual pond sediments or structural remains of the fishpond were not observed during the City Center AIS fieldwork, only fill sediments related to the pond's infilling. Because the City Center construction will extend through Kawa Fishpond, there is potential for the project to affect this archaeological cultural resource. Accordingly, discussion and evaluation of the significance of SIHP # 50-80-14-5966 are included in this City Center AIS report. SIHP # 50-80-14-5966 was originally documented by McDermott and Mann (2001) and was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i and National Registers under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location, materials, and workmanship. It has provided information on the geographical extent of the fishpond, construction materials and methods, and aquacultural practices. Based on the documentation provided by McDermott and Mann (2001), this buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria A, B, or C.

SIHP #50-80-14-6636, buried remnants of the former Kewalo wetland surface originally documented by O'Hare, Borthwick, and Hammatt (2003) and subsequently identified by O'Hare et al. (2004), Tulchin and Hammatt (2005), Clark and Gosser (2005), Hammatt (2008), Altizer, Borthwick, and Hammatt (2011), Runyon et al. (2011), and Morriss, Hunkin, and McDermott (2013; draft) was documented during the current AIS. It was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Significance Criteria A and D, for its association with major trends in the history of the state and for its information content, respectively. Based on the evaluation of this City Center AIS investigation, it is recommended that the buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Criterion A. Accordingly, the current AIS investigation recommends that SIHP # 50-80-14-6636 is only eligible to the Hawai'i and National Register under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location and materials. It has provided information on the geographical extent of the former wetland surface and the nature of the wetland environment. Additionally, these wetland deposits indicate a potential for future environmental and land use/modification studies. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria B or C.

SIHP #50-80-14-6856, buried remnants of Kolowalu Fishpond originally identified by Bell, McDermott, and O'Leary (2006) and subsequently identified by O'Hare, Bush, and Hammatt (2006), Thurman et al. (2009), and during the current AIS, was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the results of the current AIS investigation, SIHP #50-80-14-6856 is recommended

eligible to the National Register under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location, design, materials, and potentially workmanship. It has provided information on the geographical extent of the fishpond, construction materials and methods, and aquacultural practices. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria A, B, or C.

SIHP # 50-80-14-7124, buried historic building remnants originally documented by Pammer, Fong, and Hammatt (2011) and subsequently documented during the current AIS, was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Significance Criteria A and D, for its association with major trends in the history of the state and for its information content, respectively. Based on the evaluation of this City Center AIS investigation, it is recommended that the buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Criterion A. Accordingly, the current AIS investigation recommends that SIHP # 50-80-14-7124 is only eligible to the Hawai'i and National Register under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location and materials. It has provided information on early twentieth century construction materials and techniques. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria B or C.

SIHP # 50-80-14-7189, a buried fill layer containing burnt historic-era trash originally identified by Pammer, Fong, and Hammatt (2011) and subsequently identified during the current AIS, was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Significance Criteria A and D, for its association with major trends in the history of the state and for its information content, respectively. Based on the evaluation of this City Center AIS investigation, it is recommended that the buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Criterion A. Accordingly, the current AIS investigation recommends that SIHP # 50-80-14-7189 is only eligible to the Hawai'i and National Register under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location, design, and materials. It has provided information on historic-era refuse and refuse disposal, as well as historic-era land reclamation procedures. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria B or C.

SIHP # 50-80-14-7190, buried salt pan remnants originally documented by Pammer, Fong, and Hammatt (2011) and subsequently documented during the current AIS, was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Significance Criteria A and D, for its association with major trends in the history of the state and for its information content, respectively. Based on the evaluation of this City Center AIS investigation, it is recommended that the buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Criterion A. Accordingly, the current AIS investigation recommends that SIHP # 50-80-14-7190 is only eligible to the Hawai'i and National Register under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. This cultural resource maintains integrity of location, materials, and potentially workmanship. It has provided information on pre- and post-Contact salt production, as well as the geographical extent

of salt pan deposits. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria B or C.

SIHP # 50-80-14-7193, a buried, historic-era, refuse-enriched fill deposit, originally identified by Burke and Hammatt (2012) and subsequently identified during the current AIS, was previously determined ineligible to the Hawai'i Register. Based on the documentation of the current AIS investigation, SIHP #50-80-14-7193 also is recommended ineligible to the National Register. Although this subsurface fill deposit maintains integrity of location and materials, it does not contain information important to history or prehistory. This buried fill deposit is not significant under Criteria A, B, C, or D of the Hawai'i or National Register.

Although SIHP # 50-80-14-7197 was not observed in the City Center AIS, it was previously identified and documented (Pammer, Fong, and Hammatt 2011) in close proximity to the City Center APE (the Civic Center Station). Accordingly, discussion and evaluation of significance, for SIHP #50-80-14-7197 are included in this City Center AIS report. SIHP # 50-80-14-7197, a buried, culturally enriched, sand A-horizon originally identified by Pammer, Fong, and Hammatt (2011), was previously determined eligible to the Hawai'i Register under Significance Criteria A and D, for its association with major trends in the history of the state and for its information content, respectively. Based on the evaluation of this City Center AIS investigation, it is recommended that the buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Criterion A. Accordingly, the current AIS investigation recommends that SIHP # 50-80-14-7197 is only eligible to the Hawai'i and National Register under Significance Criterion D, exclusively for its information potential. Based on the documentation of Pammer, Fong, and Hammatt (2011), this cultural resource maintains integrity of location, design, and materials. It has provided information on the geographical extent of the former land surface. It should be noted that this cultural resource was not encountered during the current AIS; however, this cultural resource is in close proximity to a portion of the project area corridor. This buried archaeological cultural resource lacks the integrity of setting, feeling, and association to convey its significance under Significance Criteria B or C.